

# Scholar role activities - Critical appraisal of a paper evaluation

This evaluation form should be used by the departmental scholar role tutor or nominee to evaluate the critical appraisal of a paper undertaken by the trainee.

Trainees are reminded of the College's Academic Integrity Policy which defines the identification, investigation, management and consequences of academic misconduct and plagiarism.

## Personal details

College ID

First name \_\_\_\_\_

Surname \_\_\_\_\_

## Evaluation details

Title of Paper \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

Was the paper selected in consultation with the departmental scholar role tutor?      Yes      No

For guidance on the satisfactory completion of this activity, refer to the accompanying guidelines. Please note: The type of paper selected will determine the relevancy of completing each of the headings below

	Significant improvement required	Some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	N/A
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>				
Research question				
Type of study				
<b>RESEARCH METHODS</b>				
Setting				
Randomisation and allocation of concealment				
Population				
Inclusion and exclusion criteria				
Measurements				



	Significant improvement required	Some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	N/A
<b>RESULTS</b>				
Presentation of data				
Management of drop-outs/missing data				
Statistical analysis				
<b>DISCUSSION</b>				
Inferences from results				
Potential sources of error and bias				
Discussion of relevant literature				
Validity of conclusion				
<b>CONCLUSION</b>				
Overall quality of the study				
Clinical relevance				
Implications for own practice				

## Feedback and reflection

To be completed by the departmental scholar role tutor

<p>Examples of what was done well</p> <p><i>Example: Your overall conclusion of the study included great insight to the clinical relevance for patients and your personal practice.</i></p>	
<p>Areas that need improvement and action:</p> <p><i>Example: How the missing data was managed was not adequately explained.</i></p>	



### Departmental Scholar Role Tutor (or Nominee) signature

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

### To be completed by trainee

Trainee reflection and comments:

*Example: I found the CONSORT checklist an invaluable tool to aid my critical appraisal and interpretation of the study.*

Trainee action plan”

*Example: Next time I review a paper, I will pay particular attention to the statistical power of the study.*

### Trainee signature

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

This evaluation form should be uploaded to the Training Portfolio System (TPS).